

**MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC MEETING OF THE  
CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

**GLENDALE CITY HALL  
5850 WEST GLENDALE AVENUE  
CONFERENCE ROOM 2A**

**THURSDAY, JUNE 25, 2009  
7:00 P.M.**

Vice Chairperson Becky Shady called the meeting to order at approximately 7:00 p.m. and conducted roll call with the following results:

MEMBERS PRESENT:     Becky Shady, Vice Chairperson  
                              Jim Grose  
                              Dan Leimeter  
                              Mary Lou McNeill  
                              Linda Sue Trumble

MEMBERS ABSENT:     Charles "Bud" Zomok, Chairperson  
                              Ruth Byrne

CITY STAFF:            Ron Short, FAICP, Deputy Director for Long Range Planning  
                              Karen Flores, AICP, Planner  
                              Lisa Hunt, Senior Secretary

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

Vice Chairperson Shady called for approval of the May 28, 2009 minutes.

**Commissioner Mary Lou McNeill MADE a MOTION to APPROVE the minutes from the Historic Preservation Commission meeting held on May 28, 2009. Commissioner Dan Leimeter SECONDED the MOTION. The motion passed unanimously.**

**BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR:**

Vice Chairperson Shady called for business from the floor. There was none.

**WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES:**

Vice Chairperson Shady called for withdrawals and continuances. There were none.

**PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS:**

Vice Chairperson Shady called for public hearing items. There were none.

**OTHER BUSINESS:**

Vice Chairperson Shady called for other business.

1.     **STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE:**

James Garrison, Arizona's State Historic Preservation Officer, will address the evolution of architecture in the state from a stylistic point of view. Beginning with pre-historic sites, Mr. Garrison will focus on the key examples of architecture from San Xavier Mission near Tucson to Will Bruder's Phoenix Public Library. Statewide trends will also be tied back to architectural examples from Glendale.

Mr. James Garrison, Arizona's State Historic Preservation Officer, gave an extensive presentation with regard to the history behind Arizona's architecture from stylistic point of view, which included an 80-slide presentation. Additionally, he provided the Commission with a list of the Style Classifications, chronologically listed, beginning with the year 1750.

Mr. Garrison recommended the following books: *American Architecture Since 1780: A Guide to the Styles* written by Marcus Whiffen. Marcus was the primary architectural historian at the College of Architecture at ASU. He said that this was a primary source used in National Register nominations.

He went on to discuss another book, *Field Guide to American Houses* written by Virginia and Lee McAllester in 1984. This became the source on residential architectural styles for the whole United States. Virginia and Lee are from Dallas, Texas; so, the book tended to be Texas-centric. He said that it was hard to write a comprehensive style manual for the whole United States and this one is nice because it has a lot of architectural drawings. He created and shared with the Commission a list of stylistic classifications for the west based on this book.

He continued with a third book, *Architecture in Los Angeles* written by David Gebhard, an architectural historian from Santa Barbara, and Robert Winter, who had written a book about bungalows. Mr. Garrison liked the 1985 edition better than the current one because it had a glossary of stylistic classifications.

Mr. Garrison stated that there's an area of architecture that's more type driven, based on the floor plan of the type of building as opposed to the style. Style is usually related to construction technology and materials.

Mr. Garrison explained the meaning of the word "architecture": "archi" meaning the head or the chief; "tect" meaning worker; and "ure", the result. Therefore, the word itself means, "The result of the chief or head worker." In the middle-ages, before the renaissance, the architect was the chief worker on the site. There weren't really plans to follow, except perhaps a few sketches of things; but, during the renaissance, plans were developed and the desire to share ideas about architecture led to the first round of architects.

He continued by explaining the four basic types of architecture: 1) Folk Vernacular refers to indigenous architecture that responds to local conditions and uses local materials; 2) Mass Vernacular refers to a more widespread adoption of vernacular characteristics; 3) Pattern Book (regulated) refers to "patterns" provided in books which was prevalent in the United States in the 18<sup>th</sup> and 19<sup>th</sup> centuries; and 4) Designed (before construction) which entails the more unique custom designs.

Here are some examples of such. Mr. Garrison stated that if there's a stone here and you build something out of it to protect yourself from the weather... that would be indigenous. He said that the Hopi villages would be indigenous. Mass Vernacular is when an idea, such as a little red school house or log cabin, becomes widespread. A log cabin really isn't indigenous; and, like the little red school house, you don't need a set of plans for construction because everybody (carpenters, brick masons, etc.) knew what they looked like. That's called Mass Vernacular architecture.

And, then, you have Pattern Book, or regulated, which was derived from an analysis of schools. He asked the Commission if they were in classrooms with all the windows on one side of the room and stated that it might be thought that the architect was organizing the rooms (blackboard space, etc.).

However, around 1900, there was a regulation that all the windows in a classroom had to be on one side because it was believed cross lighting would cause an eye disease. Of course that was untrue; but, until the no-window classroom in the 1960's, all the windows were on one side. Surveys of some Nevada schools in the 1980's with 10' by 12' one-room schools showed two, double-hung windows on one side, reflecting this regulation.

He continued by discussing Designed where an architect thinks through the whole design before it's constructed. Most critics, architectural historians or the general public want to pigeon-hole architecture into design architecture. This leaves out the other three options for consideration. For example, a chief worker could build an indigenous building and it should be categorized as such, rather than having high-style architecture be your mandate. He said that he thought that the intention of the historic preservation office was to find all of these and not just the high-style architecture.

How do we evaluate architecture and what are the criteria of evaluation? The *Elements of Architecture* written by Sir Henry Wootton in 1624 establish firmness, commodity and delight. We haven't come up with a better scheme since then. He found that elder hostel people rated architecture against these three things. In a gothic cathedral there's a sense of structure and stability that's personified in the architectural firmness.

Commodity entails two areas. One is spending money wisely and the other is organizing the spaces in an efficient way (minimizing the amount of hallways, unusable space, or support spaces) to proficiently support the function. And, of course, delight. The trick of architecture is to bring delight into the equation. In Notre Dame, for example, the stained glass windows would be part of the delight of architecture.

Mr. Garrison addressed the period of 1853 (following the Gadsden Purchase of which Arizona was a part) to the present.

The Adobe tradition shown in row houses in Tucson represents mass vernacular. The row house shows window-door, window-door style coming to Arizona from Mexico—the Sonoran tradition pushing into the state. A similar tradition is the Mormon's pushing in to Utah with their tradition in Adobe—they make adobe blocks about the size of a common brick (not normal adobe sizes). A bit of influence comes from California but it's primarily from Sonoran that the Adobe tradition was brought into the state.

Mr. Garrison provided a pictorial tour of numerous buildings in Arizona, explaining the evolution through adobe structures to the Victorian influence, Neo-Classical, Spanish Revival, Craftsman, Post World War II styles, and the more contemporary styles. He explained the dynamics of the transition and integration among the various styles and their relationship to the Arizona climate and cultural influences. He noted the uniqueness of the Burton Barr Library which is designed specifically for and works extremely well for the Arizona desert climate and is a building that would not work in any other setting.

#### **STAFF REPORT:**

Ms. Karen Flores, AICP, Planner, announced to the Commission the plans for distribution of 118 bronze plaques in the Catlin Court expansion area at meetings to be held on July 20<sup>th</sup> and 27<sup>th</sup> and August 17<sup>th</sup> and 24<sup>th</sup> with Councilmember David Goulet attending. With regard to ranch house historic districts, the Thunderbird/McDonald Addition and Northfield were being worked on. At a

meeting with residents from Thunderbird last night, about 30 people attended. Councilmember Yvonne Knaack, Commissioner Mary Lou McNeill, Mr. Bob Graham, and Mr. Ron Short, FAICP, Deputy Director of Long Range Planning also attended. The meeting catalyzed the citizens to take some steps to becoming a neighborhood association. Next Monday will be a meeting with the Northfield residents.

**CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT (CLG) GRANT FUNDS – SANDS ESTATES:**

Ms. Flores said that they would be moving forward with the nomination for Sands Estates using CLG funds.

**POSSIBLE SPEAKERS FOR MEETINGS OF THE HPC IN THE FALL:**

Ms. Flores continued by discussing fall speakers and indicated that possibly Garn Emery, Deputy City Attorney, would discuss Open Meeting Law in September. Other possibilities may be the Glendale Tourism office, Arizona State Library and Sarival Farms.

**STATUS OF REHABILITATION PLANS FOR THE MORCOMB PROPERTY:**

Mr. Short provided an update regarding restoration of the Morcomb property.

**VACATION OF UPCOMING HPC MEETINGS:**

Ms. Flores recommended that the meetings for the month of July 23 and August 27, 2009 be vacated. Vice Chairperson Shady called for a motion.

**Commissioner Jim Grose MADE a MOTION to VACATE the July 23 and August 27, 2009 meetings. Commissioner Leimeter SECONDED the MOTION. The motion carried unanimously.**

**COMMISSION COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS:**

The Commission stated that they had a wonderful time at the conference.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

The meeting adjourned at approximately 8:45 p.m.

**NEXT MEETING:**

The next Historic Preservation Commission meeting will be held September 24, 2009.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Lisa Hunt, Recording Secretary